

Name Einrichtung:	
Land (Name) / Bund:	
Name / Kontakt	
für Rückfragen von GKSt. GDI-DE:	

**IMPORTANT INFORMATION TO FULFILL THE TABLE**

Some parts of the table are locked and the user cannot change them.  
 All the comments should be entered into ONE table and put into ONE worksheet. This worksheet should be the first worksheet in the workbook in the case it consists of many worksheets.  
 User can add new rows, format cells, clear contents, sort the content of the table and uses other tools.

DS - D 2.3 - Draft Definition of INSPIRE Annex Themes and Scope: Comments Sheet						
1	2	3	4	5	6	
Comment ID	Chapter, section or clause no./Subclause No.	Paragraph/Figure/Table	Type of comment	Comment (justification for change)	Proposed change	
	Note[1]	Note[2]	Note[3]		Note[4]	
1		(references to other documents)	G	Not all quoted documents are accessible.	Please add links to all documents or - if no links are available - give advice, where to obtain documents.	BE/BB
2		(abbreviations)	G	abbreviation missing	Add: RDM = Reference Data and Metadata ( <a href="http://www.ec-gis.org/inspire/records/topology_pages/inspire_rdm_no_v4_3_en.pdf">http://www.ec-gis.org/inspire/records/topology_pages/inspire_rdm_no_v4_3_en.pdf</a> )	BGR
3		(abbreviations)	G	abbreviation missing	Add: ETC = European Topic Centre	BGR
4		Purpose of the document, Fig. 1	G	Fig 1 of D2.3 and Fig. 1 of D2.5 are not harmonized.	Amend Fig. 1, in a way that it shows the connections between D2.3 and D2.5	GDI-DE
5	several		G	D2.3 does not yet contain mandatory clauses for standards and attributes. This seems to be necessary regarding D2.3 as a fundament for an Implementation Rule. E.g. chapter 5.1 on p. 19 "Coordinate reference systems / Scope, use examples" only contains vague recommendations to use ISO 19111 and ETRS89 for implementations. Furthermore, under "feature types and attributes" (e.g. p. 20) there is not yet a concept to discern into mandatory and optional fields	D2.3 should contain mandatory clauses for standards and attributes. Under "feature types and attributes" there should be discerned into mandatory and optional fields.	BY
6	several		G	The descriptions of the themes seem to contain too many local characteristics, e.g. "The grid is based on the Lambert Azimuthal Equal Area coordinate reference system (ETRS-LAEA)" is not true general	The descriptions of the themes should be expressed in a more general way.	BY
7	several		G	Insufficient structure of the theme-related sheets	It is suggested to structure the theme-related sheets as follows: - definition, - description, - feature types and attributes (mandatory/optional), - use examples, - links and overlaps with other themes, - reference documents, - suggested contributors in further specification work	BY
8	2.2		E	duplicate: UN-ECE	delete one of them	BY
9	2.2		E	UNFCCC: wrong acronym	UNFCCC = United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change	BY
10	2.2		G	amendment of an important application field of INSPIRE: GMO monitoring	amend: GMO - Genetically modified organisms	BIN
11	4		G	Reference data - functional requirement: "provide a context to allow others to better understanding the information that is being presented" is similar to "Metadata"	delete this point	BY
12	5.5	Description	E	"An address ... expressing the fixed location of a ... building" contradicts with the following recommendation that addresses are related to real properties (that means also for cadastral parcels etc.)	Please make the requirements consistent	BY-sei
13	5.6	Definition, scope	T	Since the scope of cadastral information in the INSPIRE context is limited to the geographic side and excludes legal information the WP 4 definition of a parcel is not sufficient	Use the INSPIRE interpretation of a parcel.	BY-sei
14	7.2	Description	T	"The location of a building should be described by coordinates". Does this mean that buildings should be represented by points or potentially also by polygons?	Please clarify	BY-sei
15	5.5	Important feature types and attributes	G	The relationship between address and cadastral parcel affect data security interests. In Germany such personal data are subject to special restrictions.	Add: Considerations of data protection.	RLP
16	5.5		G	In Germany the local authorities are responsible for the allocation of address identifiers. But they are not able to make data available as described in the chapter 5.5. Other authorities hold secondary data sets, but these are not complete in either case.		RLP
17	5.5	feature types and attributes	T	"The main feature types are address with relationships to other features such as cadastral parcel, (apartment-) building and other immovable register objects (such as utilities)." not in German AAM Model	relevant is the address and the relation to the set of coordinates	BY
18	5.5	general note	G	An important feature type is the cadastral parcel, buildings, etc.	These themes must be coordinated more clearly when being assessed to data specifications	BGR
19	5.6	Important feature types and attributes	G	The same problem with data security like comment above (ID 1).		RLP
20	5.6	Important feature types and attributes	G	In Germany the attributes of parcels are [held] in different registers and by different authorities (surveying authorities and local courts. This makes an up-to-date and uniform presentation difficult, caused by the redundant data management.		RLP
21	5.6	"additional content" S. 33	G	a Europe-wide standardized classification will be difficult		BY
22	5.6	feature types and attributes	T	This also implies that every boundary would be stored at least two times (in left and right parcel), which is redundant." This is not the case in German AAM Model	define obligatory and optional attributes	BY
23	5.6	reference documents	E	The definition of Germany's AAA-Modell (GeoInfoDok) is missing	add the "GeoInfoDok"	BY
24	5.7	Important feature types and attributes	G	The transport network is a part of topographic data. In Germany the ATKIS-model describes this data. Navigation attributes are not contained		RLP
25	5.9	general note	G	What about national protecting categories? It is not clear how the refer to NATURA 2000/FFH (national parks; landscape protection areas, sea and lake shore protection areas, etc.)	Special threat of destroying cultural heritage in this special area - Special imposts of the cultural heritage Authority	NI
26	5.9	Important feature types and attributes	T	extension of two attributes in the scope of preservation of ancient monuments		NI
27	5.9	scope, use examples; paragraph 5 Nationally designated sites...	G	needs further explanation; categories of App. D Standard Data Form Natura2000 should be obligatory; CDDA categories should be used if App. D SDF does not fit		NW_H
28	5.9	important feature types and attributes; 1. item classification system	G	can be done without, if the classification on SDF Natura 2000 is obligation		NW_H
29	5.9	important feature types and attributes; 6. item reference to	E	"relevance" should be added	reference to relevant legal foundation/agreement	NW_H
30	5.9	important feature types and attributes; 8. item date of modification	E	"latest" should be added to avoid several dates	date of latest modification of protected site	NW_H
31	5.9	reference documents; additor	E	missing: (App. D of) Standard Data Form Natura 2000	(App. D of) Standard Data Form Natura 2000 should be added	NW_H
32	6.1	general note	G	Digital Elevation Models (DEMs) are extremely important for many applications. The link to national topographic assessments, from which DEMs in many countries still come from (unless they use SRTM or SRTM), may need more focus, because specific harmonization tools are needed; what kind of uncertainties exist, and what kind of pre-processing is needed to make such data compatible to Europe-wide available data such as SRTM (except northern Europe); links to existing accessible data as examples are missing.	Broaden topic: Digital Elevation Models (DEMs). Add examples for existing accessible data.	BGR
33	6.2	"Features" S.46	G	missing: Structuring of areas in term of Corine (311, 312, 313, 244)	Structuring in term of Corine (311, 312, 313, 244). Coniferous - mixed - broad leaved forest, agro-forestry area	BY
34	6.2	feature types and attributes	E	missing: "Water bodies", also a part of Hydrography (5.8)	add attribute "water bodies" to paragraph 5.8	BY
35	6.2	general note	E		Delete "orthophoto", add "orthoimagery"	BGR
36	6.2	Description	E	- Links and overlaps with other themes (p. 46): First sentence: theme Orthophoto does not exist (see Orthoimagery); - Are there links to projects which have harmonized national/EU other land cover nomenclatures? - Link and short descriptions about LUCAS? - Link do DECOVER and other similar national initiatives;		BY
37	6.2	Description	G	wrong reference to the theme "land use": it is number 4 of annex III, not number 5 as mentioned here. In the domain of preservation of ancient monuments exists the need for historization of spatial objects. These information are very useful in regard of cultural heritage questions, so the following amendment is requested. Orthoimages can be divided in greyscale or color images.	In this way it is different from the land use data (annex III, theme number 4), dedicated to the description of the use of the earth surface. To evaluate territory (especially in regard of cultural heritage questions) there should be a historical dimension i.e. information on land cover in former times (chronologically).	NI
38	6.3	Description	E	Chapter 6.3 contains no "important features". A possible classification is: "True Color" (aerial photograph) and "Pseudo Color" and different ranges of scale (remote sensing)	Insert: "Orthoimages are typically greyscale or color images." Insert: "True Color" and "Pseudo Color"	RLP
39	6.3		E			RLP
40	6.3	links	E	missing: "Land use"	add "Land use"	BY
41	6.3	feature types and attributes are missing	G	feature types and attributes are missing	add feature types and attributes like: year, producer, scale, reference system	BY
42	6.4	Scope, 9th bullet point	E	more consistent wording	add "providing"	BGR
43	6.4	Scope, 10th bullet point	E	hydrogeology is included already in bullet points 3 and 5	Delete: hydrogeology	BGR
44	6.4	Scope, 11th bullet point	E	more consistent wording	Change "adding value" instead of "add value"	BGR
45	6.4	Scope, 12th bullet point	E	more consistent wording	add "Providing"	BGR
46	6.4	Overlap and links with other themes, bullet point list	T	these themes are missing	Add two additional bullet points: "environmental monitoring facilities" and "sea region"	BGR
47	7.2	Description	G	The same problem with data security like comment above (ID 1).		RLP
48	7.2	Important feature types and attributes	E	Quantifying the height of buildings can be difficult, caused by the different types of roofs. The number of floors are easier to detect. A better description for size of building is floor space and gross volume.	Insert: "number of floors" Change size to: "floor space and gross volume"	RLP
49	7.2	description	E	In Germany the owner of a cadastral parcel is the owner of the building on it	delete "Relevant to couple with information on e.g. ownership, size, height"	BY
50	7.3	page 60, "links"	G		link to natural risk zones	BY
51	7.3	General note	G	At this point, the description of soil covers the full spectrum of soil information, mostly referring to the European scales. The feature types and attributes table has been deleted from an earlier draft. This is regarded as a mistake because now the attributes are complete, missing.	Add the feature types and attributes table (from an earlier draft). In order to harmonize the presentation of the theme with other themes, it (the table) may need shortening.	BGR
52	7.5	Geographical distribution over exposure elements	G	amendment of GMOs having potential adverse effects on human health	amend: ...Exposure to GMOs in the environment, in air, water, food and soil is currently receiving particular attention since it may potentially cause adverse effects on human health and the environment.	BIN
53	7.5	Links and overlaps with other themes:	T	connection between GMO environmental monitoring facilities and human health monitoring	amend: Environmental monitoring facilities	BIN
54	7.5	Links and overlaps with other themes	T	geological data are also used to for health reasons, e.g. to compare the spatial distribution of cancer with possible radon emitting rocks or content of nitrate in groundwater	add new bullet point "Geology"	BGR
55	7.5	Links and overlaps with other themes	T	soil data also could be used for health reasons, e.g. for the origin contaminated food or drinking water	add new bullet point: "Soil"	BGR
56	7.6	page 72, the paragraph before "Examples"	E	proposed new paragraph after "environmental protection facilities"	add: "natural hazard protection facilities"	BY
57	7.6	page 73 f., "Important feature types and attributes"	E	missing classification for "environmental protection facilities"	Classify "environmental protection facilities"	BY
58	7.6	page 74, "Overlaps and links with other themes"	G	additional theme	add 4th bullet: "landuse and natural risk zones"	BY
59	7.6	Overlaps and links with other themes, bullet point list	T	geological data are an important base to determine ground stability for building technical buildings, infrastructure, houses	Add new bullet point "Geology"	BGR
60	7.6	Overlaps and links with other themes, bullet point list	T	soil data also could be of use for planning of pipelines, electrical transmission lines and phone/data cables - used for health reasons also for the origin of contaminated food	Add new bullet point "Soil"	BGR
61	7.6	Overlaps and links with other themes, bullet point list	T	the location of energy resources is important when planning e.g. and gas pipeline	Add new bullet point "Energy Resources"	BGR

62		Examples – Sewage/wastewater treatment sit	G	Give information on waste water.	Add: Is this facility subject to Directive 91/271/EEC (urban waste water) / industrial waste water).	NW_G2
	7.6					
63	7.7	Description	E		Text should begin: Monitoring sites are locations and areas....	BN
64	7.7	Scope, use examples	T	Monitoring adverse effects of genetically modified organisms extends to a wide range of biotic parameters which have to be georeferenced (Directive 2001/18/EC).  This theme is interlinked with paragraph 7.5, because the Directive extends on adverse effects on both the environment and on human health.	amend: - GMO monitoring sites and areas: Directive 2001/18/EC, Annex VII ( <a href="http://ec.europa.eu/environment/biotechnology/pdf/dec2002_811.pdf">http://ec.europa.eu/environment/biotechnology/pdf/dec2002_811.pdf</a> ) stipulates that monitoring and reporting on the deliberate release of GMOs are carried out in the environment. Examples of elements to be monitored are: a) effects on non-target organisms (including development of resistance in wild relatives) or pest organisms, change in the host range or in the dispersal of pest organisms and viruses, development of new viruses; b) dispersal, establishment and persistence into non-target environments or ecosystems; c) out-crossing with sexually compatible wild relatives in natural populations; d) unintended changes in the basic behaviour of the organism, for example, changes in reproduction; e) changes in biodiversity (e.g. in number or composition of species). The monitoring design (sites and areas) must be indicated. It includes agricultural fields where the crop is commercially grown as well as surrounding habitats.	BN
65	7.7	Important feature types and attributes:	T	Amendment of data collection methodology	amend: data collection method (ISO, CEN)	BN
66	7.7	Reference documents	T	Amendment	amend: Directive 2001/18/EC, Annex VII ( <a href="http://ec.europa.eu/environment/biotechnology/pdf/dec2002_811.pdf">http://ec.europa.eu/environment/biotechnology/pdf/dec2002_811.pdf</a> ) on the deliberate release of GMOs into the environment	BN
67	7.7	Links and overlaps with other themes	T	geology, in particular aquifer information, is an essential base for ground and surface water monitoring stations	add new bullet point "Geology"	BGR
68	7.7	Links and overlaps with other themes	T	Soil information is the base for soil monitoring sites	add new bullet point "Soil"	BGR
69	7.7	Suggested contributors in further specification work	E	Typing error	write: "EuroGeoSurveys (EGS) instead of "EuroGeosurveys"	BGR
70	7.7	Examples	E	"surface monitoring station" is not commonly use	surface water monitoring station	NW_G2
71	7.7	Examples	G	If the Council Directive 76/160/EEC on Bathing Water Quality is mentioned, also the Fish Water Directive (78/659/EEC) and Directive 76/464/EEC - Water pollution by discharges of certain dangerous substances, could be listed.	Add: Fish Water Directive (78/659/EEC) and Directive 76/464/EEC - Water pollution by discharges of certain dangerous substances.	NW_G2
72	7.8	Links and overlaps with other themes	T	geology, which includes ground stability, is important when planning transmission lines, pipelines, and any industry or production facility	add new bullet point "Geology"	BGR
73	7.8	Links and overlaps with other themes	T	soil information may be important for building agriculture facilities	Add new bullet point "Soil"	BGR
74	7.8	Links and overlaps with other themes	T	the location of energy resources is important when planning transmission lines and pipelines, e.g. oil and gas pipeline	Add new bullet point "Energy Resources"	BGR
75	7.8		G/E	7.8 on several occasions makes reference to the IPPC Directive (Directive 96/61/EC), that constitutes in Art. 15 (3) the European Emission Register (EPER). In the meantime the PRTR Regulation (Regulation (EG) No. 166/2006 vom 18.01.2006) has become effective. This Regulation establishes an integrated pollutant release and transfer register at Community level (PRTR) - and it deletes (among others) Art. 15 (3) of the IPPC Directive. Consequently, the EPER does not exist any more.	Mention the "PRTR Regulation" under "Definition" and within other relevant parts of text.  Change from "EPER" to "PRTR"	NW_G2
76	7.8	Description	T	Usage of lesser-known systems for categories (e.g. SERIEE) may cause substantial additional effort. Recommendation: Usage of PRTR categories that comprise nearly all relevant industrial activities.	Delete: "SERIEE", change to: "category according to PRTR"	NW_G2
77	7.8	Important feature types and attributes	T	Up to now, the location of plants or technical facilities is stated as point coordinates. If "area objects" are requested to show the dimension of company grounds, this will require considerable additional effort and expense	Omit: "area objects".	NW_G2
78	7.8	Important feature types and attributes	T	There is no collection of information available on "transmission lines and pipelines" in LANUV (Landesamt für Natur, Umwelt und Verbraucherschutz NRW) - Additional data collection may be very costly	Omit: "transmission lines and pipelines".	NW_G2
79	7.9	Links and overlaps with other themes	T	Soil information is important for the location of agriculture facilities	Add new bullet point: "soil"	BGR
80	7.9		G	With regard to "agricultural and aquaculture facilities", the LANU (Landesamt für Natur, Umwelt und Verbraucherschutz NRW) only has information regarding facilities mentioned in PRTR resp. in the German "4. BImSchV" (large-scale keeping of animals and aquaculture plants > 1000 t/a). Data collection for additional facilities would be very costly.	Restriction to the themes mentioned in the PRTR Regulation.	NW_G2
81	7.11	page 87 "links"	G		Links to land use and natural risk zones	BY
82	7.11	Links and overlaps with other themes	T	soil information may be important for building agriculture facilities	Add new bullet point "Geology"	BGR
83	7.11	Links and overlaps with other themes	T	information about mineral resources is an essential base for the management of prospecting and mining permit area	Add new bullet point "Mineral Resources"	BGR
84	7.11	Links and overlaps with other themes	T	information about energy resources is an essential base for the management of prospecting and mining permit area	Add new bullet point "Energy Resources"	BGR
85	7.12	page 92 "links"	G		Link to environmental protection facilities	BY
86	7.13	Scope, use examples, first bullet point, 2nd line	E	typing error	Write "solar" instead of "soar"	BGR
87	7.13	Links and overlaps with other themes	T	Geology information is the base for the reconstruction of historic climate scenarios and thus helps predicting future climate scenarios	Add new bullet point "Geology"	BGR
88	7.13	Links and overlaps with other themes	T	soil information may add value to the reconstruction of historic climate scenarios and thus help predicting future climate scenarios	Add new bullet point "Soil"	BGR
89	7.13	Links and overlaps with other themes	T	The use of fossil energy resources are thought to be an important factor of climate change. Thus, information about these may add value to the issue of atmospheric conditions	Add new bullet point "Energy Resources"	BGR
90	7.15	Links and overlaps with other themes	T	geological processes form the ocean floor morphology	Add new bullet point "Geology"	BGR
91	7.16	Links and overlaps with other themes	T	a link to Geology information will add value to coastal land planning as a part of sea regions. Geology helps to reconstruct processes that are important for that issue	Add new bullet point "Geology"	BGR
92	7.18	page 106 "links"	G		Add link to "land use"	BY
93	7.18	Description	G	The definition of habitats and biotopes should follow the common scientific state of the art which is represented by the modified text	Change 3rd sentence of first para of description to: "Common to all spatial data ... living organisms, biotopes being the spatial and biotic environment of a biotic community / biocoenosis, while habitats being the spatial environment of specific species."	BN
94	7.18	Reference documents	G	The additional reference includes a comparison between the EUNIS "Habitat Classification System" and the german list of biotopes. It was not yet registered as an INSPIRE reference document	Add a new reference document: "Rote Liste der gefährdeten Biotoptypen Deutschlands" (Riecken et al. 2006, Naturschutz und Biologische Vielfalt 34).	BN
95	7.18	scope, use examples; 2. paragraph A selection of ...	G	If all classifications and codes of all Member States (and all German States) are allowed, interoperability (of this theme) will be impossible	Classification and codes of FFH, Birds Directive, OSPAR and HELCOM should be obligatory. CODA categories should be used if those mentioned do not fit	NW_H
96	7.18	important feature types and attributes; both tables	G	to make it up with the different concepts of biotopes and habitats in order to end up with one list of attributes (resp. one object type) the idea of "typical species" from the Habitat Directive should be applied to biotopes; what you get is the similar list of attributes listed for habitats.	attributes for biotopes/habitats: class/nomencl. system, category name, category code, mapping date (latest verification date), species or typical species to which the habitat or biotope refers, site description	NW_H
97	7.19	Important feature types and attributes	G	The vernacular name should be used for vertebrates (without fishes) only. For other groups of fauna and flora several names are used even in one language or there isn't any vernacular name.	Add a footnote to "vernacular name": "For vertebrates only (without fishes)."	BN
98	7.19	Important feature types and attributes: Observation point	T	Amendment: If the observation method is not described, the data from different sources may not be compatible	add: observation method	BN
99	7.19	Important feature types and attributes: Observation point	T	The meaning of "Period" and "Function" is not comprehensible.	delete: "Period?" and "Function?"	BN
100	7.19	description; clarification: 2. item, last sentence	G	grouping of species may change many times (see nomenclature the past ten years)	"Earlier INSPIRE documents ...to families."  For reasons of frequent changes in the grouping of species this should no longer be considered.	NW_H
101	7.19	scope, use examples; 2. paragraph Digital data sets	G	"combinations of species in communities" can not be deduced from common occurrence in grid-cells	Deletion of this term	NW_H
102	7.19	important feature types and attributes; Grid cell or area: period present ...	G	this is difficult with regard to species: they may stay throughout the year with one part of the population while the other part migrates; the dates depend on annual whether development rather than stay stable; data regulations seem to be difficult -	Deletion of this item	NW_H
103	7.19	important feature types and attributes; Grid cell or area: status: ...	G	in Germany, the status of threat is not defined in IUCN-categories	extinct, etc. (preferably IUCN-category)	NW_H
104	7.19	important feature types and attributes; observation point: period?	G	inadequate to a single observation (most likely type of observation)	Deletion of this item	NW_H
105	7.19	important feature types and attributes; observation point: function?	G	definition of references needed; most likely data of this kind are very rare	Deletion, or definition of references	NW_H
106	7.19	important feature types and attributes; observation point: status:	G	definition of references needed; most likely data of this kind are very rare	Deletion, or definition of references	NW_H
107	7.19	classification/nomenclature: last item	E	missing: Codina system for status and function	Codina system for status and function has to be defined	NW_H
108	7.19	classification/nomenclature: last item	E	classification for status	IUCN classification for status may be considered as preferable	NW_H
109	7.20	Description, 4th line	E	grammar	Add a comma after "Thus"	BGR
110	7.20	Description, 5th line	E	grammar	Add a comma after "However"	BGR
111	7.20	Description, first bullet point list, first bullet point	T	correct terminology	Write "oil accumulation: hydrocarbon fields, petroleum volumes", delete former sentence	BGR
112	7.20	Description, second bullet point list, first bullet point	T	correct terminology	Write "natural gas accumulations: hydrocarbon fields", delete former sentence	BGR
113	7.20	Description, first bullet point list, third bullet point	T	correct terminology	Write "Coal and lignite deposits"	BGR
114	7.20	Description, second bullet point list, fifth bullet point	T	correct terminology and explanation	Delete former content "Energy sources ... rivers, sea, air". Write instead: "Geothermal energy: Geothermal energy systems use the natural heat of the subsol by utilising warm water for direct heating or electricity generation (opensystem). Alternatively, heat from the subsol may be extracted by heat pumps (closed system). Heat pumps are suitable, too, for example for extraction of heat from the air, rivers, seas	BGR

[1] Use "3.1" instead of "Clause 3.1" or "Chapter 6.1". This makes grouping of comments easier.

[2] E.g., Table 1

[3] Type of comment can be G (general), E (editorial), T (technical)

[4] The proposed change must be as precise and specific as possible.